

CARTWRIGHT'S PUZZLE

86

THE JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY

Problem 4. Consider the following:

(1) The last word of (1) is obscene.

(2) The last word of (1) is obscene.

It would appear that (1) cannot be turned into a truth by addition of quotation marks but that (2) can be so changed—namely, by putting quotation marks around its last word. Yet it would also appear that (1) = (2); and if this is so, then by Leibniz's Law whatever is true of (2) is also true of (1). How is this apparent contradiction to be resolved?

(We are grateful to Professor Richard Cartwright of M.I.T. for allowing us to use Problem 4, which he once posed to his class.)

We also renew our invitation for contributed papers; *these* should have a reading time of twenty minutes (approximately ten typed pages) and should be submitted in triplicate, together with an abstract no longer than 150 words. Contributed papers should also be sent to Professor Bromberger, M.I.T.; the deadline for submission is April 15, 1971.

Richard Cartwright

The Journal of Philosophy, Vol. 68, No. 3 (Feb. 11, 1971).